

## Learning tasks

### Pakistan: Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs)

*This document outlines pedagogical activities connected to a learning document and a podcast about Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) to improve foundational learning in Pakistan, with a focus on the Sindh province. Even if PPPs are not a relevant policy concern in your country, reflecting upon the requirements for their success is likely to help in thinking through other education interventions.*

*We suggest that you use this script as a guide, and explore and expand the themes it highlights in directions that are relevant to your own context. We also suggest that you follow these learning tasks as part of a group so you can challenge each other's assumptions and perspectives but below you will also find guidance for individual use.*

*The developers of these documents are eager to understand how your experience was using this document. Please write to [lemann.foundation@bsg.ox.ac.uk](mailto:lemann.foundation@bsg.ox.ac.uk).*

### **INSTRUCTIONS**

***If you are doing this exercise in a group: please jump to page 03.***

***If you are doing this individually, please follow the self-guided study strategy:***

#### **Self-guided study activity**

**(Suggested time: 90 minutes)**

Design thinking is an effective strategy for self-guided study. This approach encourages active engagement with the learning material, fostering creativity and critical thinking, essential for addressing complex policy challenges. Using techniques such as mind mapping (a visual technique for organising ideas) and ideation (a brainstorming process for generating new ideas) allows

learners to deconstruct intricate topics into smaller, manageable components and explore various perspectives, leading to tailored and innovative solutions.

Cultivating an open and curious mindset through design thinking is important for learning and adapting to the rapidly changing global landscape. Policymakers who approach challenges with fresh perspectives can develop creative solutions to multifaceted problems, driving positive change in their regions. The method also aids in the development of crucial skills, such as critical thinking, problem-solving, collaboration, and communication.

In conclusion, design thinking is an ideal strategy for self-guided study of the learning documents we developed. Its structured approach enhances engagement with the material and instils vital transferable skills, empowering professionals to make informed, impactful decisions in their communities.

We invite you to try some design thinking strategies as you explore the learning documents. By using these techniques, you can engage with the material in a more dynamic way and gain insights and perspectives that are likely to serve you well in many areas of your work.

### **Step 1: Review the PPP learning document and podcast about PPPs in Pakistan (15 minutes)**

Review the learning document and podcast focusing on the following aspects:

- Goals of the PPP initiative
- Stakeholders involved
- Key success factors
- Challenges faced and how they were addressed

Take notes on your findings and consider how these insights could apply to your own context.

### **Step 2: Reflect on the education system in your country or region, considering the challenges faced by PPPs (15 minutes)**

Consider the education system in your country or region, paying particular attention to the challenges that PPPs face. Some of these challenges may include:

- Unequal distribution of benefits between public and private partners
- Lack of transparency and accountability in PPP arrangements
- Limited access to quality education for marginalised groups such as low-income families, girls, and children with disabilities
- Inflexible contractual agreements that can limit the room for adaptation to circumstances of public partners

- Weak or inadequate regulatory frameworks for monitoring and regulating the performance of private partners

Reflect on these challenges and how they may impact the potential success of PPPs in your context. Write down your thoughts in a short paragraph.

### **Step 3: Identify potential PPP opportunities in your context (10 minutes)**

Based on your review and reflection, identify at least two potential opportunities for implementing PPPs in your context. For each opportunity, consider the following questions:

- What is the problem or need being addressed?
- How could the PPP solution address the problem or need?
- Who are the key stakeholders involved and what are their roles?
- What are the potential benefits and consequences of implementing this PPP solution?

Write down your thoughts in a structured manner, outlining each opportunity with its corresponding strategies and consequences.

### **Step 4: Identify potential PPP challenges in your context (10 minutes)**

Based on your review and reflection, identify at least two potential challenges of implementing PPPs in your context. For each challenge, consider the following questions:

- What is the challenge and why is it a potential barrier to implementing PPPs?
- How could the challenge be mitigated?
- What are the potential benefits and consequences of addressing this challenge?
- Write down your thoughts in a structured manner, outlining each challenge with its corresponding strategies and consequences.

### **Step 5: Create a hypothetical PPP proposal (30 minutes)**

Develop a hypothetical PPP proposal for your context, addressing one of the identified opportunities or challenges. Your proposal should include:

- A brief description of the problem being addressed
- An overview of the proposed PPP solution
- Key stakeholders and their roles
- A high-level implementation plan, including timelines and milestones
- Success indicators and evaluation methods
- Strategies for addressing the identified challenges

### **Step 6: Reflect on the learning process (10 minutes)**

Reflect on your learning experience throughout this activity. What new insights did you gain about PPPs and their potential in education? How do you think these insights could inform your future work in the education sector?

Write a brief reflection on your learning process and its potential impact on your professional development.

By completing this self-guided study activity, we hope you have gained a deeper understanding of the potential and challenges of PPPs in education, and how they could be effectively implemented in your context. This knowledge can be valuable in driving future initiatives and discussions within your professional network and organisation.

### **Group exercise guide**

**(Suggested time: 1 hour)**

*If this is a self-organised group, please pick someone to act as a moderator. When the group is first gathered, take some time to recall the major themes of the materials before jumping into the first discussion or dividing into groups.*

#### **Question 01 (20 minutes)**

**Suggestion for moderator:** ask them to work individually and write their answers. Then make a group count of who answered questions number I and II. If possible, divide in pairs for further discussion. If not, discuss in plenary.

#### **Pick one of these two actors and write it down:**

- I. *If you have worked in PPPs in the past, or have mostly experience inside of the public sector:*

An education policymaker from another country in the Global South calls you. He/She wants to establish an education PPP to run some schools in their community with the hope of improving foundational learning.

- a) What are two pieces of advice you would give him/her?
- b) Now reflect about context – do you think your answer is too closely related to the particular context that you imagine him/her asking about or could it be generalisable to other contexts?

- II. *If you have not worked in PPPs in the past, or have mostly experience outside of the public sector:*

You are starting to consider using PPPs to run schools in your community with the goal of improving foundational learning. You then decide to call a friend from a Global South country who has worked with PPPs in the past.

- a) What are the questions that you want to ask?
- b) Now reflect about context – do you think your answer is too closely related to the particular context you imagine yourself asking about, or could it be generalisable to other contexts?

### **Question 2 (20 minutes)**

**Suggestion for moderator:** come back to plenary for this question. Ask for volunteers to share their answers then make a general discussion.

Now consider the nine areas of concern in PPPs that we have previously highlighted: institutional capacity, institutional resistance, regulatory framework, accountability mechanisms, measurement and assessment, private regulation, scalability of best practices, equity concerns and contract flexibility.

- a) Describe one area that you think could be a source of strength/opportunity for implementing education PPPs in your country and describe another area that could be a source of risk/weakness for implementing education PPPs in your country; justify your answer.

*(If most people have no experience of PPPs in your group, or the discussion is not productive, we suggest to prompt discussion about a theme other than PPPs by moving to parts b, c, and d)*

- b) Get the class to suggest some ideas for what the biggest debate in education in their country is right now. Then, once the topic is chosen, ask someone to choose, out of the nine areas of concern described in the learning document (institutional resistance, equity concerns etc), which one matters most for this new topic of discussion.

- c) Why is this area (or these areas) of concern so relevant to the specific intervention or policy that you are discussing?

- d) Discuss in the group whether you think that more could be done (or could be done differently) in your country to improve this problem? You might want to consider, for example, the need to coordinate better between different stakeholders, and other such issues.

### **Question 3 (20 minutes)**

**Suggestion for moderator:** form new pairs or go to your original pairs to have a discussion.

**Pick one of these two actors:**

- I. You are the main education officer at a charity organisation specialised in running low-cost private schools in a Global South country. You are interested in scaling up to help improve foundational learning outcomes, and using PPPs is a possible pathway for that. But you are also aware of the risks that going in this direction could pose for your organisation, including financial (if disbursements are not timely), reputational (if schools have bad results), legal (if the legal arrangement is not sound), etc.
- II. You are the secretary of education in a local province in a Global South country. You have been doing your best to improve learning outcomes in your province, but resources are scarce. You recently received a proposal from an organisation that is willing to take over some schools in return for a subsidy per student lower than your current rate.

Now imagine you are in a meeting together:

- a) What is your opening statement?
- b) Describe one aspect of educational practice that you see as non-negotiable, and why you think it's this way. Then describe another aspect for which you would be willing to negotiate and why you think so. How flexible do you think you should be, and over just this aspect, or others, too?
- c) Continue going back and forth in conversation with your partner. Could you agree on the basic elements of your PPP agreement, or at least on some common priorities to discuss in the next meeting?
- d) Give each other feedback on how the conversation went. Do you have ideas for how your partner could have explained their position more clearly and persuasively? Do you think they missed any points that are likely to be important for someone in the role they took on for this exercise?-